APPEAL	NABC+ NINETEEN
Subject	Misinformation (MI)
DIC	Candace Kuschner
Event	NABC+ Open Swiss Teams
Session	Second Qualifying
Date	August 1, 2009

BD#	**24**
VUL	**None**
DLR	**West**

Evette Mashaal	
♠	K Q 7 6
♥	9 8 7 6 5 4
♦	6 2
♣	9

Shannon Cappelletti	
♠	J 9 8 5 3
♥	2
♦	A Q T 8 5
♣	T 8

Summer 2009
Washington D.C.

Sheri Weinstock	
♠	
♥	K Q J T 3
♦	K 4
♣	A 7 6 5 4 3

Ghassan Menachi	
♠	A T 4 2
♥	A
♦	J 9 7 3
♣	K Q J 2

West	North	East	South
Pass	Pass	1♣	1NT
2♦	2NT[1]	3♥	Pass
3♠	Dbl	4♥	Pass
5♣	Pass	Pass	Dbl
Pass	Pass	Pass	

Final Contract	**5♣ doubled by East**
Opening Lead	**♠A**
Table Result	**Down 2, E/W -300**
Director Ruling	**2NT S down 4, N/S -200**
Screener Ruling	**5♣ dbld E, down 2, E/W -300**
Committee Ruling	**5♣ dbld E, down 2, E/W -300**

(1)	Not Alerted; intended as "just making noise."

The Facts: The director was called at the end of the match. Lebensohl is marked on the front of the N/S convention card and systems on is written on the back of the convention card. There was a failure to Alert 2NT as a relay to 3♣. East said that with an Alert there was no hurry to bid 3♥. She was worried about a club lead knocking out her entry if the auction ended in at 2NT.

The Ruling: The failure to Alert constituted misinformation (40A4) but since it was too late to allow a change of call (Law 21B3), the score was adjusted to 2NT by South down four, N/S minus 200 for both sides under the assumption that East, South, and West would pass over an unAlerted 2NT. [Law 12C1(e)]

The Appeal: N/S appealed the director's decision. In screening the table director's ruling was changed to the table result of 5♣ doubled by East down two, E/W minus 300. E/W appealed that decision and all four players attended the hearing.
North's 2NT bid not appear to be natural, when one looks at her hand. Had 2NT been Alerted as Lebensohl, East wasn't sure that she would have risked bidding 3♥.
North described her 2NT bid as an attempt to "make a noise." Although they play 2NT as Lebensohl after a 1NT opening, neither player thought that North's 2NT was Lebensohl. In the NT overcalls section of the convention card, both North and South's convention card had written in "Front of card." When asked about the auction 1♦-1NT-Pass, they said that 2♣ would be Stayman and 2♦ would be a transfer.

The Decision: The committee judged that North's hand speaks for itself. North either thought her hand was too good to bid only 2♥ or perhaps was concerned that a 2♥ bid might be treated as a transfer. She did not intend to play in 2NT (or 3NT) when she bid 2NT. Thus, there was misinformation.
Many players would open 1♥ with the East hand. A player who chooses to open 1♣ is committed to bidding the hearts later unless it becomes highly unattractive to do so. West's 2♦ bid was not unwelcome, since East had a partial fit for the suit.
If North's 2NT were natural, East would expect a hand with about 8 HCP, balanced or semi-balanced. If North's 2NT is Lebensohl, the most likely type of hand (based on East's hand) would be an invitational hand with long spades. That type of hand would have a bit less in high cards and more in shape. Thus, if 2NT were Lebensohl, a bid of 3♥ would be more likely to catch a fit and some useful high cards.
Therefore, the failure to Alert made it less attractive for East to bid then an Alert would have, so E/W were not damaged by the misinformation.
The committee reinstated the table result of 5♣ doubled by East down two, E/W minus 300.

The Committee: Doug Doub (Chair), Jeff Goldsmith, Richard Popper, Lou Reich and Jim Thurtell.

Commentary:

Goldsmith Right. No appeal without merit warning (AWMW) is appropriate if the screening director changes the ruling; the players do not have enough time to make a good judgment whether or not to appeal.

Polisner Good work by the screener and committee.

Rigal I can understand the committee ruling here but I'm not sure I would have taken such a negative position for the non-offenders. My heart tells me that I would have stuck with the director ruling, although on a purely intellectual basis I find it hard to argue against the committee.

Smith Just because North bid 2NT and her hand indicated it was intended as Lebensohl doesn't mean that was actually their agreement. So although the North hand may "speak for itself" in terms of what was intended, it cannot speak to the actual N/S agreement. But I do think the convention card as described does show that this pair played Lebensohl in this situation. In any case, I agree with the screening director and the committee that if 2NT had been Alerted East has more reason to bid 3♥ than over a perceived natural 2NT.

Wildavsky Good work by the committee and the screening director. The director's table ruling was reasonable, though. N/S had given misinformation, and initially it seemed it might have led to damage.

Wolff This ruling seems way too strong in favor of E/W. Why would 2NT be Lebensohl instead of her just bidding her suit at the two-level?