

APPEAL	Non-NABC+ Six
Subject	Unauthorized Information (UI) - Tempo
DIC	Mike Flader
Event	First Friday/Saturday KO - Bracket 15
Session	Round Two
Date	July 21, 2007

BD#	30	130 Masterpoints
VUL	None	
DLR	East	
136 Masterpoints		Summer 2007 Nashville, Tennessee
♠	K J 2	
♥	Q 3 2	
♦	A 9 7 4	
♣	T 7 4	
		171 Masterpoints
♠		
♥		
♦		
♣		
		91 Masterpoints
♠	A 6	
♥	A 7 4	
♦	K Q 3	
♣	A K Q 6 2	

West	North	East	South	Final Contract	3NT by South
		Pass	2♣	Opening Lead	♥2
Pass	2♥ ¹	Dbl ²	2NT ³	Table Result	3NT, making 3, N/S +400
Pass	3NT	Pass	Pass	Director Ruling	2NT, making 3, N/S + 150
Pass				Panel Ruling	3NT, making 3, N/S +400

(1)	Alerted as double negative.
(2)	Shows desire for heart lead.
(3)	Bidder said "huh."

The Facts: When North bid 2♥, South alerted. After East doubled, South muttered "huh" and broke tempo, then bid 2NT.

The Ruling: Contract is 2NT making three, N/S plus 150 per Law 16A and Law 12C2.

The Appeal: N/S appealed and all four players attended the hearing. North stated that partner's bid showed 22-24 HCP and that she couldn't pass 2NT at anything less than game, despite the fact that partner's hand might be limited to 22 HCP. She didn't think that a break in tempo (BIT) or the "hmm" uttered by her partner made any difference in the meaning of the bid. She also liked the texture of her hand with the tens and nines, and since she promised less than a king, she was at the top end of her bid and that in a team game, she had to be in game.

In N/S's methods a 2NT opening shows 20-21 HCP. South stated that he often makes sounds and mannerisms and that he didn't think his partner's actions were affected in any way by the sound he had uttered.

The Decision: Ten players of 100-200 masterpoints were polled. Seven players were asked to respond to the original auction after the 2NT rebid; five bid 3NT with the North cards. One player passed 2NT, but when asked what a slow 2NT bid might show, she had no idea that it meant anything different than a bid in tempo. One player thought that a slow 2NT bid showed that opener might be at the top of his range or might have been thinking of bidding 3NT on his own.

Three players were given the entire auction. They were all asked what the 2NT rebid showed, and all responded that it meant partner had a balanced 22-24 count. When asked what a slow 2NT rebid would show, all said that it meant exactly the same as an in tempo 2NT bid.

Based upon these interviews, it was determined that at this level of play, most players were not aware of what the BIT might suggest. It was ruled, therefore, that the Unauthorized Information did not demonstrably suggest the chosen action.

Since N/S did not violate Law 16A, the panel restored the table result of 3NT by South, making three, N/S plus 400,

The Panel: Harry Falk (Reviewer), Bernie Gorkin and Gary Zeiger.

Players Consulted: Ten players with between 100 and 200 masterpoints.

Commentary:

Polisner I can only wonder what the reason for the ruling was. Seems to be quite a simple ruling.

Rigal Excellent Committee Ruling -- the initial director ruling surprises me because I would have expected the director to come to the same conclusion as the players canvassed; but, in a sense, that is unimportant since justice was done at the end.

Smith Good job by the panel. Hesitations and the like don't carry the same implications to newer players as they do to those with more experience.

Wildavsky A player who was considering 2NT might well have been thinking of 3NT instead. On the other hand, he might have been thinking of making a forcing pass. I would find it difficult to demonstrate that a slow 2NT suggests 3NT. I prefer the panel's ruling, but the tournament director's (TD's) was not clearly mistaken. I'm always happy to see the TD cite the laws he applied -- I'd have liked to see him explain his reasoning as well.

Wolff The committee's decision not the director's decision was correct. Why didn't either body get into how 3NT was made. Since it should be defeated, there should be no discussion on whether to allow the contract to be bid.