

APPEAL	NABC+ ONE
Subject	Misinformation (MI)
DIC	Henry Cukoff
Event	North American Pairs Flight A
Session	Second Qualifying
Date	March 11, 2009

BD#	26
VUL	Both
DLR	East

Leo Lasota	
♠	9 8 7
♥	K 9 3
♦	K J T 4 3
♣	T 3

Richard Oshlag		Spring 2009 Houston, TX	Dave Smith	
♠	K 5 4 3		♠	A T
♥	J 8 7 4		♥	A Q 5
♦	Q		♦	7 5 2
♣	Q 8 6 2		♣	A K J 7 5

Mark Shaw	
♠	Q J 6 2
♥	T 6 2
♦	A 9 8 6
♣	9 4

West	North	East	South
		1♣	Pass
1♥	Pass	2NT	Pass
3♣ ¹	Pass	3♥	Pass
3NT	Pass	Pass	Pass

Final Contract	3NT by East
Opening Lead	♠J
Table Result	Made 3, E/W + 600
Director Ruling	3NT E, made 3, E/W +600
Committee Ruling	3NT E, made 3, E/W +600

(1) Checkback Stayman.

The Facts: The director was called at the end of the play of the hand. Before the opening lead South asked about the 3♣ bid and was told that it was checkback. He asked whether 3NT was a choice of games. East said, "I don't know." West said nothing, and later said it was undiscussed.

The Ruling: There was no evidence that E/W had any undisclosed agreements. In accordance with Law 40, the table result of 3NT by East making four, E/W plus 600 was allowed to stand for both sides.

The Appeal: N/S appealed the director's decision. East was the only player who did not attend the hearing.

South believed that there must have been a partnership agreement. He suggested that East must know that the sequence showed 4-4 in the majors or he would have corrected to 4♥. West confirmed that they had no partnership agreement and that they had recently stopped playing Wolff signoff at East's request.

The Decision: South had implied that had he known that West was showing 4-4 in the majors, he'd have led a diamond instead of a spade.

South and West had confirmed their difference of interpretation when asked whether 3NT was "choice of games."

After reviewing Laws 20, 40 and 41 (with assistance from the screening director, Olin Hubert), the committee found no evidence of an undisclosed partnership understanding. Therefore, the committee ruled as the director had and allowed the table result to stand.

The appeal was found to have merit.

The Committee: Mike Kovacich (Chair), Dan Gerstman and Chris Moll (Scribe).