APPEAL	NABC+ FOUR
Subject	Unauthorized Information (UI)
DIC	Henry Cukoff
Event	Silodor Open Pairs
Session	Second Final
Date	March 14, 2009

BD#	**25**
VUL	**E/W**
DLR	**North**

Kent Mignocchi	
♠	K J 5 3 2
♥	T 5
♦	Q 5 4 2
♣	A 7

P. Drew Cannell	
♠	8 6
♥	K Q J 8
♦	A K T 3
♣	K 5 4

Spring 2009
Houston, TX

Dennis Kasle	
♠	A Q T 7 4
♥	4 3
♦	J 9 6
♣	T 6 2

Alison Wilson	
♠	9
♥	A 9 7 6 2
♦	8 7
♣	Q J 9 8 3

West	North	East	South
	Pass	Pass	Pass
1NT	2♦[1]	2♥	Pass[2]
3♥	Pass	3♠	Pass
3NT	Pass	Pass	Pass

Final Contract	**3NT by West**
Opening Lead	**♦2**
Table Result	**Made 4, E/W +630**
Director Ruling	**4♠ E, down 2, E/W -200**
Committee Ruling	**4♠ E, down 2, E/W -200**

(1)	Diamonds and an unspecified major.
(2)	Question: What is 2♥? Answer: Natural.

The Facts: The director was called after the opening lead and again after play was completed. Before the opening lead there was discussion about the 2♥ bid. East said it was a transfer. West said it became obvious later in the auction that 2♥ was a transfer.

The Ruling: The director ruled that the answer to the question about 2♥ was UI for East. The UI demonstrably suggested to East that the contract should not be placed in hearts. The director judged that 4♠ over 3♥ or 3NT was a logical alternative. Therefore, the result was adjusted to 4♠ by East, down two, E/W minus 200 for both sides. This was in accordance with Laws 12 and 16.

The Appeal: E/W appealed and South was the only player who did not attend the hearing. East provided system notes showing that without interference, the 3♥ would indicate a doubleton heart along with spade support. East argued that his hand didn't merit anything other than signing off in 3♠. When asked why he passed 3NT, he mentioned the possibility of Kx or AQ doubleton in hearts.

The Decision: The director reported polling five experts with three of five stating they would bid 4♠ over 3♥, but that they had been told that 3♥ showed heart values with spade support. The consensus of the committee was that with 3♥ showing a doubleton, the odds didn't favor committing to game. However, it was agreed that a substantial fraction of players of the caliber of the appellants would seriously consider bidding 4♠ (or 4♦ or 4♥ to make West declarer) and that some would bid it. Therefore, there was unanimous agreement to uphold the director's adjustment of 4♠ by East down two, E/W minus 200 for both sides, per Laws 12 and 16.

The appeal was found to have merit.

The Committee: Mark Feldman (Chair), Lynn Deas, Danny Sprung, Patty Tucker and Bob White.