

APPEAL	NABC+ FOUR
Subject	Misinformation (MI)
DIC	Henry Cukoff
Event	Blue Ribbon Pairs
Session	First Qualifying
Date	November 21, 2006

BD#	26
VUL	Both
DLR	East

Mark Bennett	
♠	K 9 8 6 3
♥	J T
♦	Q 8 4 3
♣	Q 5

Judy Schulman		Fall 2006 Honolulu, Hawaii	Rich Karpowicz	
♠	J 5 2		♠	7
♥	7		♥	A 8 6
♦	A T 9 7 5		♦	K J 2
♣	K T 8 7		♣	A J 6 4 3 2

Iku Donnelly	
♠	A Q T 4
♥	K Q 9 5 4 3 2
♦	6
♣	9

West	North	East	South
		1♣	1♥
Dbl	Pass	2♣	2♥
3♣	Pass	Pass	3♥
4♣	Pass	5♣	Pass
Pass	Dbl	Pass	Pass
Pass			

Final Contract	5♣ doubled by East
Opening Lead	♥K
Table Result	Making 7, E/W +1150
Director Ruling	5♣ dbld by E, E/W +1150
Committee Ruling	5♣ dbld by E, E/W +1150

The Facts: E/W play that the negative double of 1♥ is for takeout and denies four spades.

The Ruling: The table director, after due consultation with other tournament directors, decided that this use of a negative double is not Alertable, per ACBL regulations. If it is not Alertable, then the failure to alert it is not an infraction - MI.

The Appeal: N/S appealed on the basis that they believed that this interpretation of the regulations was incorrect.

The Decision: It is not normally within a committee's ambit of authority to interpret the laws and regulations. However, laws 92 and 93 required the committee to consider the appeal. The committee believed that its options were to 1) agree with the director's interpretation, or 2) to resubmit the issue to the tournament directors for reconsideration of their previously stated interpretation. The majority of the committee concluded that the ACBL regulations do not require Alerts for this negative double. The wording of the regulation suggests that an Alert is only required for highly unusual meanings of a double. The committee majority decided that this was not a highly unusual meaning of the negative double of 1♥. Accordingly, the committee did not resubmit the issue to the directors, but merely affirmed the decision that there had been no infraction.

The Committee also felt that this was an appropriate matter to forward to the ACBL for a definitive statement.

The Committee/Panel: Jeff Goldsmith (Chair), Darwin Afdahl, Joann Sprung, Peggy Sutherlin and Jim Thurtell.